

Summary Midterm Results Review:

DAP Education Programming 1997-1999
CRS/Ghana, Burkina Faso, Haiti, India

Cornelia Janke (Education Development Center, Inc.)

Martin Pittman (Consultant)

October 2000

Contents

Executive Summary

Introduction

Program Goals and Objectives

Data Collection and Management

Discussion of Results

Analysis of Results

Acronyms

| | |
|------------|--|
| AED: | Academy for Educational Development |
| CRS: | Catholic Relief Services |
| DAP: | Development Activity Proposal |
| ECD: | Early Childhood Development |
| EDC: | Education Development Center |
| EU: | European Union |
| EMIS: | Education Management Information System |
| FAE: | Food-Assisted Education |
| FFP: | Food for Peace |
| FFW: | Food for Work |
| DANIDA: | Danish International Development Agency |
| HHN: | Health, Hygiene and Nutrition |
| IEC: | Information and Education Campaign |
| IFES: | International Foundation for Electoral Systems |
| IPTT: | Indicator Performance Tracking Table |
| FY: | Fiscal Year/school year |
| MCH: | Mother-Child Health |
| MTR: | Mid-term Review |
| NGO: | Non-governmental Organization |
| PLA: | Participatory Learning and Action |
| PRA: | Participatory Rural Appraisal |
| PTA: | Parent-Teacher Association |
| QUIPS: | Quality Improvement in Primary Schools |
| SED: | Small Enterprise Development |
| SFP: | School-Feeding Program |
| ST/SC/OBC: | Scheduled Tribes, Scheduled Castes, and Other Backward Classes |
| THR: | Take Home Ration |
| UNICEF: | United Nations Children's Fund |
| USAID: | United States Agency for International Development |
| WFP: | World Food Program |

Executive Summary

Given the relative newness of the Food Assisted Education model (defined by CRS as a set of “interventions supporting long-term education objectives that are being implemented with food, among other, resources”), the ultimate efficacy of FAE programs in improving educational outcomes is currently unknown. However, a review of FAE program monitoring data from four large CRS FAE programs between 1995 and 1999 yields preliminary results that indicate success in increasing and maintaining enrollment and attendance rates, compared to baseline and/or control schools. No conclusive statements can yet be made regarding school retention or achievement data.

To date, no studies have attempted to link particular elements of FAE programs (school infrastructure improvement, community participation, teacher support etc.) with particular impacts. Therefore it is difficult to make conclusive statements regarding the relative efficacy of any particular intervention as compared with others. However, the monitoring data reviewed for this document point to several FAE elements of particular promise. These include:

- ✓ School meal programs (attendance, enrollment)
- ✓ Take-home ration interventions for girls (attendance, enrollment)
- ✓ Community-implemented school infrastructure development activities (attendance, enrollment, community perception of school, community involvement in education)

Two other FAE activities, community participation in education and teacher support, seem intuitively to hold promise. However, no conclusive monitoring or community-level data have yet been reported for these FAE elements.

As FAE programs in Haiti, Ghana, Burkina Faso and India enter their final year of the current USAID Food for Peace Title II DAP funding cycle (1997-2001), it is helpful to review these programs' evolution and results to date. However, each country program pursues similar goals and objectives using different activity portfolios, implementation methodologies, progress and success indicators, and monitoring and evaluation methodologies. Therefore, comparison of program activities across countries is difficult.

The current DAP cycle has been one of evolution for all education programs reviewed. As education management staffs have sought to improve the quality of their services, they have made adjustments to program objectives, activities, targets, and monitoring and evaluation methodologies. Given the new and dramatic programming shifts initiated in this cycle, such modifications are both appropriate and healthy. However, although modifications have been in the long-term best interests of the program, they have made it difficult for these programs to demonstrate beneficiary-level impacts. Any final evaluation of program results for this DAP period should therefore contain an assessment of organizational-level impacts in addition to beneficiary-level impacts, as a means of determining not only the current efficacy of these programs, but also their longer term prospects for impact and sustainability.

Currently, in addition to reporting impact-level data for enrollment, attendance, retention and achievement, programs report primarily output-level information regarding community involvement, school infrastructure improvement or health, hygiene and nutrition (HHN) activities. No attempts have yet been made to correlate the results of these activities with school enrollment, attendance, progress or achievement data. In addition, it should be noted that the present review of program monitoring documents reveals a great degree of variability among programs regarding data collection, analysis and reporting procedures. Data is often incomplete and of questionable reliability. A more in-depth review of each country program's monitoring and evaluation system and reporting is therefore recommended before any final statements are made regarding the efficacy of interventions described here.

Qualifying statements notwithstanding, program monitoring documents do reveal a number of noteworthy outcomes for the 1996-1999 period. A summary of the most salient findings follows.

- Burkina Faso and Ghana programs report improved primary school enrollment rates over baseline in targeted schools. Girls' enrollment increases are particularly notable, growing by FY98 to 50% over baseline in Ghana and 12% over baseline in Burkina Faso. Haiti and India programs do not track enrollment.
- All country programs report increased primary school attendance rates over baseline. After an initial rise relative to baseline, attendance levels off at a higher sustained rate (ranging from 77% in Ghana to 89% in Haiti) than in non-program schools.
- Girls' enrollment and attendance increases are particularly notable in primary schools implementing a Take-Home Ration program (Burkina Faso, Ghana, and India). Girls' enrollment in Ghana THR schools increased 6% between FY97 and FY99, while girls' enrollment in Burkina THR schools increased 12% between FY98 and FY99. Regarding attendance, 70% of girls in Ghana achieved 85% monthly attendance in FY99, compared with 39% of girls in comparison schools. In Burkina, 86% of girls achieved 85% monthly attendance, compared with 81% of girls in control schools. India does not report enrollment or attendance data for its THR component.
- Burkina Faso reports a 13% decline over baseline in primary school girls' dropout rates, and a 7% decline in that for boys, while India data indicates that girls' and general dropout rates have remained steady relative to baseline, at 5% and 6% respectively. Ghana and Haiti do not report on dropout.
- Exit examination pass rates declined for girls in Burkina Faso and for all students in Haiti, the only country programs to track this indicator. In Haiti, pass rates were nonetheless consistently higher than the national average.

- School feeding activities, and particularly Take-Home Ration interventions, are viewed by parents surveyed to be an effective incentive for increasing enrollment and attendance in program schools, particularly for girls.
- CRS education staff state that support for early child development programs in Ghana and India is linked to increased primary school enrollments in associated schools. Also, average attendance rates at early childhood development centers in India between FY97 and FY99 were 72%. CRS/Ghana reported a 7% increase in attendance at early childhood centers between FY97 and FY99, for an average monthly attendance rate of 83%. Early childhood centers in both countries receive food assistance. In India, early childhood teachers receive training as well.
- In Ghana, Haiti and Burkina Faso, CRS has assisted a total of 974 communities in improving school infrastructure, including classrooms, teacher dwellings, latrines and potable water installation. Infrastructure improvements were reported in all countries to be an effective means of involving the community in school quality improvement and in improving parents' and students' attitudes about school. CRS/India does not engage in school infrastructure improvement.
- All countries include parental/community involvement activities in their education programs. Haiti reports that in FY99, 69% of the PTAs receiving CRS support were 'functional' (having democratically elected members and holding at least one meeting per semester), and that 21% were involved with school improvement projects. Currently, Ghana, Burkina Faso and India do not report on the "functionality" of PTAs, nor on the efficacy or nature of PTA training, nor on the nature or success of PTA or community-sponsored activities. Nonetheless, Mid-term Reviews of all country programs acknowledged that community participation/parental support for education activities do or could play an important role in CRS education programs.

Introduction

Catholic Relief Services' largest and oldest USAID Food for Peace (FFP)-supported education programs take place in Ghana, Burkina Faso, Haiti and India. For decades, CRS implemented school feeding initiatives in each of these countries. However, in the mid-1990's, amidst an increasingly results-oriented climate within USAID, the Food for Peace office requested that CRS demonstrate the educational impacts resulting from their feeding activities. CRS recognized that educational impacts were difficult to derive from school feeding activities alone. In response to this recognition, the agency developed a programming model that included school feeding within a broader, more comprehensive array of interventions designed improve school quality. This *Food Assisted Education (FAE)* model is currently defined within CRS as a set of "interventions supporting long-term education objectives that are being implemented with food (among other) resources." FAE aims to have both short-term and long-term food security impacts. Short-term impact is achieved simply by feeding hungry children. Long-term food security impact is based on the widely supported recognition that an educated populace has more capacity and opportunity to ensure food security for itself and for the society as a whole.

USAID Food for Peace support for education is granted in five-year increments, made on the basis of an approved multi-sectoral *Development Activity Proposal (DAP)*. The Burkina, Ghana, Haiti¹ and India programs began implementing the FAE model in the FY 1997-2001 DAP period. Because the programming approach was new, the FFP office demonstrated significant flexibility in approving a range of FAE interventions, supported both by direct distribution of food and by monetization of food resources. Since initiation of the FAE model, all country programs have experienced evolutions in the design, staffing, implementation and monitoring of their education activities. Now these programs are entering the final year of the 1997-2001 DAP cycle, and have begun looking to the future. All four country programs plan to continue their FAE programming and will submit a follow-on DAP for the 2002-2007 period. FFP has indicated that it will continue to support those FAE programs that can *demonstrate significant results* of their programming. However, monetized support for education programming will no longer be available through FFP. Country programs will thus need to seek other donor support for the non-food elements of their education programming. Assessment of program results will take place through final evaluations of each country program, overseen by the Food for Peace office during fiscal year (FY) 2001.

Both in preparation for these final evaluations, and as a planning aid for the next DAP development process, it is useful to understand the results of FAE programming to date. Thus, CRS requested that Education Development Center (EDC) review reporting documents for all four country programs from FY97 (FY96 for Haiti) through FY99, and

¹ CRS/Haiti actually initiated FAE activities beginning in FY96. The program received a one-year extension, thus bringing it into synchronization with the other three country programs, officially begun in FY97.

report on the progress made during this time. The review is based on internal documents such as Annual Results Reports (ARRs) and Indicator Performance Tracking Tables (IPTTs) for the 1997-99 period. Results of Mid-term Reviews (MTRs), commissioned by CRS and conducted in 1999 by teams composed both of CRS staff and external consultants, are also included in this report.

Program Goals and Objectives

Although all four country programs described in this review made a similar transition from school feeding to a broader education focus, each program is based on a different goal and objectives. The aims of these programs are similar. Yet each country program is designed to meet a differing set of performance targets and indicators, using a varied package of interventions and differing implementation methodologies. The education goal and objectives of each country program are described in Table I, below; Table II, following, illustrates the particular interventions used by each country program to reach its objectives.

Table I: Goal and Objectives of the CRS Burkina, Ghana, Haiti and India programs, 1997-2001

| Burkina Faso | Ghana | Haiti | India |
|---|---|---|--|
| <p>DAP goal: A better educated, more productive population capable of contributing to household, community and provincial food security</p> <p><i>Obj 1:</i> Increased educational access and success for rural, food insecure children</p> <p><i>Obj 2:</i> Increased girls' enrollment/attendance at targeted primary schools</p> <p><i>Obj 3:</i> Increased parental awareness of, involvement in, and support for primary school education for both girls and boys</p> | <p>Sub-Goal: Improve primary education in selected schools in rural communities in the three northern regions of Ghana by:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Increasing enrollment 2) Increasing attendance 3) Increasing girls' attendance 4) Improving infrastructure 5) Strengthening PTAs | <p>Sub-Goal: Improved educational achievement for primary school students</p> <p><i>Obj 1:</i> Alleviate temporary hunger and improve attention levels of students</p> <p><i>Obj 2:</i> a. Maintain or increase attendance rates of schools by having regularly provided a mid-morning meal. b. Increase attendance rates of newly admitted program schools</p> <p><i>Obj 3:</i> Improve health, hygiene and nutrition knowledge, attitudes and practices, and decrease illness-related absences</p> <p><i>Obj 4:</i> Improve the capacity of local PTAs in pilot schools to independently address important issues related to educational attendance & attainment</p> | <p>Strategic Obj: Improve primary school completion rates among disadvantaged (SC/ST/OBC²) children, especially girls</p> <p>Intermediate result: achieve and sustain attendance, retention and promotion targets for disadvantaged children, especially girls</p> |

² Scheduled Caste (SC), Scheduled Tribe (ST) and Other Backward Classes (OBC) are the official categories designated by the Government of India to describe marginalized groups.

Table II: FAE Program Components in CRS' four largest Title II education programs 1997-2001

| | Burkina Faso | Ghana | Haiti | India |
|---|--------------|-------|-------|-------|
| School Feeding | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Take-home rations | ✓ | ✓ | | ✓ |
| Infrastructure improvement ³ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | |
| Parent involvement | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Partner organization capacity building | | | | ✓ |
| Teacher training | | | ✓ | ✓ |
| IEC campaign | ✓ | ✓ | | ✓ |
| ECD | | ✓ | | ✓ |
| Non-formal education centers | | | | ✓ |
| Health-Hygiene-Nutrition ⁴ (HHN) | ✓ | | ✓ | |
| Attendance registers | ✓ | | ✓ | ✓ |

The goals, objectives and activities described in Tables I and II include the amendments to the program as proposed and approved during the DAP period. While changes in programmatic goals were minimal, alterations in objectives and, more often, in targets and strategies, reflect the on-going evolution of the efforts of each country program. Programmatic changes also reflect the changing needs of program partners and the evolution of skills and resources within CRS. Following is a brief summary of the strategic and programmatic changes in the education activities of Burkina Faso, Ghana, Haiti and India between fiscal years 1997 and 1999.

Burkina Faso

With this DAP period, Burkina Faso began to focus its interventions on the education sector, and to re-design initiatives to ensure measurable impact. This re-design, in turn, has lead CRS to pursue a policy of strengthening local counterparts (primarily local education officials and community members) and transferring responsibility for many operational aspects to them. CRS/BF has worked closely with the government to develop the skills necessary to manage and implement a large-scale feeding program, and to identify non-CRS sources of support for the program. At this time, the school feeding initiative is officially no longer implemented by CRS, but by the Ministry of Education, with CRS support. In addition to the commodities provided by USAID via CRS, the national school feeding program utilizes commodities provided by the European Union (EU).

CRS/Burkina introduced three new education-related activities to complement school feeding in this DAP period. The first, a pilot take-home ration program for girls, was designed to improve the enrollment and attendance of girls relative to boys. The second, designed to improve children's health, nutritional and psychosocial status, is a series of

³ Includes classrooms, water and sanitation, and teachers' quarters

⁴ Includes one or more of: HHN education, micronutrient supplementation, anthelmintics, first aid kits

Health, Hygiene and Nutrition (HHN) activities such as delivery of vitamin A supplementation and de-worming medication to targeted primary school students. Finally, CRS/BF implemented a food-for-work school infrastructure improvement initiative, designed to build/improve classrooms, provide water and sanitation infrastructure, and build teachers' quarters. In addition, CRS/BF implemented an Information, Education and Communication (IEC) campaign to complement all other initiatives. The campaign was designed to raise the awareness of community members to issues, such as girls' participation in schools, HHN needs of children and adults, and community involvement in education. CRS developed and utilized materials such as drawings, bulletin boards and awareness guides for use in the campaigns. Additionally, the services of a Theater for Development troupe were utilized in some project communities.

In addition to its education programming, CRS/BF implements microfinance (income-generating activity credit), emergency humanitarian response and welfare initiatives.

Ghana

As in Burkina Faso, Ghana's food assisted initiatives include school feeding and a girls' take-home ration program. School meals are also provided to a number of preschools associated with CRS-supported primary schools. An important additional component of the program includes community mobilization activities designed to facilitate PTA development, support PTA-managed, community-implemented, school improvement projects, and build capacity and awareness regarding the community's role in the support and management of food assisted initiatives. Infrastructure improvement projects involve a shared commitment in which communities receive materials assistance after contributing demonstrably to structural improvements (further described on page 20). IEC activities such as radio broadcasts and posters are designed to support the other initiatives.

CRS/Ghana submitted and received approval for two DAP Amendments--one in FY 98 and another in FY 00. The FY00 DAP Amendment included a modification of objectives, indicators, and life of activity performance targets for the education program. These changes include a limitation of the addition of new schools to the program, in order to sustain the manageability, accountability and quality of services.

Another important evolution in the CRS/Ghana education program is CRS participation, beginning fiscal year 2000, in the USAID/Ghana mission-supported *Quality Improvements in Primary Schools (QUIPS)* program. QUIPS offers selected communities support for a comprehensive package of teacher training, curricular improvement, infrastructure improvement and community participation. Seventy-two CRS-supported communities will benefit from the QUIPS initiative through FY2002. QUIPS activities come in addition to other CRS support, such as school feeding.

In addition to education programming, the CRS/Ghana portfolio includes food-assisted child survival (FACS), relief assistance to victims of drought, and general relief efforts.

Haiti

Haiti's education programming includes a school canteen serving a mid-morning meal, HHN activities, PTA development and PTA managed, community implemented school improvement projects. In addition, CRS/Haiti is a subcontractor to the Academy for Educational Development (AED) in the USAID-funded *Education 2004 Project*, designed to deliver radio-based distance education in Math and Creole and pedagogy training for teachers to targeted schools.

During the current DAP period CRS/Haiti experienced sudden shift from a "phase down" approach to programming, to a significant increase in program schools. Rather than phasing out from just over 400 schools, CRS expanded services to more than 550 schools. CRS added new schools in response to government and USAID requests for an expanded school feeding initiative. CRS/Haiti implemented a layered implementation approach, in which program schools were classified according to three levels of intervention: priority, intermediate and general. Schools in priority zones, determined as those with the greatest food security risks *and* those with proximity to other CRS sectoral interventions (SED, MCH, and Agriculture), receive a 'package' of support which includes school feeding; distribution of vitamin A and de-worming medicine; HHN education; attendance registers; and, PTA strengthening. Priority zone schools participating in the Education 2004 project (described elsewhere in this report) receive, in addition, teaching materials, distance education (radio instruction), and facilitation of teacher instruction. Program animators visit priority zone schools monthly. Intermediate schools participated in school feeding and vitamin A and de-worming medicine distribution, and were visited by animators at least once per trimester. (CRS/Haiti discontinued this category after FY99, with all intermediate schools being reclassified as 'general schools'. General schools focus on school feeding exclusively, are visited by animators once or twice per year, and are visited by end-use checkers quarterly.

In addition to education, the Haiti program implements small enterprise development, maternal-child health, agriculture, sanitation, civil society/human rights, and social assistance activities.

India

Unlike the other country programs, CRS/India does not directly implement activities. Instead it works through a network of 53 *Counterpart Organizations*, which are program managers, and 2,100 *Operating Partners*, which are program implementers. Program activities are, in turn, implemented in some 3,463 institutions, including early childhood development (ECD) centers, 952 primary schools, 1631 boarding schools, and 35 non-formal education centers. Partners are distributed among four large regions of the country, and managed separately by zonal offices. Because CRS/India works 'through' a range of institutional partners, each with its own program, activities, objectives and limitations, issues such as targeting, intervention methodology, capacity of individual partner organizations, and programmatic consistency nationwide are of particular concern.

The current DAP period marks the beginning of a major re-orientation of the CRS/India Title II program from an institution-based to a community-based development program. Key components of this shift have been initiation of re-targeting strategies; investment in additional education staff for CRS and institutional partners; capacity building in teacher training and participatory rural appraisal techniques; development of management information systems; and, development of improved community outreach strategies.

In addition to education, CRS/India undertakes activities in small enterprise development, maternal-child health, agriculture, and social assistance.

Currently in India, as in Haiti, Ghana and Burkina Faso, programmatic integration among education and other sectorally focused interventions is minimal. However, CRS/India education staff recognizes that greater programmatic integration is critical for the long-term sustainability of education (and development) initiatives, and plans greater programmatic integration in the future.

Data Collection and Management

All country programs have monitoring and evaluation (m&e) units. However, unit configuration, as well as data collection, analysis and reporting, vary among programs. All programs except Ghana conducted specific baseline analyses for this DAP period.

Burkina Faso hired external consultants to design and implement a baseline analysis, and to assist in developing an m&e unit. The baseline was conducted in FY97 and focused on basic school participation measures--enrollment, attendance, repetition, dropout and passage/failure--and on rates of student achievement of a primary school certificate. These data were gathered for a total of 350 schools, of which 272 (78%) operated school lunch programs, and of which the remaining 78 schools (22%) had no supplemental feeding programs. In 28 of the schools, this information was collected for individual students in all grades. CRS/BF has continued to collect information from these schools for monitoring purposes, and relies on MOE staff for both community facilitation and data collection. In FY98, some of the provinces surveyed underwent reconfiguration, thus making it difficult to compare baseline with subsequent year data. To facilitate the collection of regular and reliable attendance data, CRS/BF developed an attendance register and distributed this to all program schools. The register was subsequently adopted by the MOE and is currently being used nationwide. The CRS/BF m&e unit issues regular progress reports regarding the impact indicators described above, as well as data on a range of process indicators. A detailed baseline survey report is also available.

In Haiti, baseline data was collected in FY 97 on a sample of 29 schools. Data include information on attendance and a number of school quality indicators relating to teachers, physical school plant, and teaching-learning materials. In addition, CRS/Haiti collects attendance, pupil flow and examination pass rate data for all program schools. As in Burkina, CRS/Haiti designed and delivered attendance registers to all program schools, most of which, as private schools, had previously not recorded attendance. The attendance register differentiates between illness and non-illness related absences and

relies on self-reporting by school staff. Beginning in FY00, all CRS schools adopted the MOE attendance register.

Regular reporting of education data in Haiti has been minimal. This may be due to the fact that the monitoring and evaluation unit serves all CRS/Haiti program sectors, not just education. Currently, Haiti reports no baseline data or pupil flow data. It does report attendance and examination pass rate data, as well as a range of process-related data.

India conducted a baseline survey in early FY98 using a two-stage stratified cluster sample design. Stratification at the first stage involved counterpart institutions from each of the twelve states where CRS/India works. Institutions were selected according to their geographic coverage of the CRS target population (tribal and non-tribal groups). In general, one partner was selected from each state where all partners in that state served similar populations. In states where partners served both tribal and non-tribal populations, two counterpart institutions were selected, to represent both types of populations. A second stage cluster sample at the institutional level was based on male/female representation, institutional type, number of years of operation, institution size, and location of institution. CRS/India chose to work with a small sample of institutions (33) due to the high degree of homogeneity among institutions, which it believed reduced the design effect associated with a cluster sample.

Data collected include enrollment, attendance, completion and promotion rates. These are collected from school registers. Initially, CRS/India relied on self-reporting by institutions. However, due to questions about reliability, CRS/India later trained *Counterpart* staff in data collection. Local education officials also participate in data collection. Currently, CRS/India believes data reliability at the institutional level is high.

As a result of its shifting focus from institutions to community-based development programming, and its commitment to demonstrating educational impact, CRS/India recognized, in FY99, that its current monitoring indicators and systems were insufficient to track program progress. CRS/India thus negotiated with USAID to establish a new set of process indicators, to be used in future reporting. CRS/India expects that these indicators and subsequent refining of the management information system will not only improve reporting to USAID, but will also provide relevant information to community groups, schools, Operating Partners and Counterparts. The CRS/India monitoring and evaluation unit serves all program sectors, not just education.

CRS/Ghana did not collect baseline data. Instead, it reviewed previous program data to establish "initial contact" enrollment and attendance figures for each school, thought to represent enrollment and attendance levels prior to CRS involvement. Baseline is defined as "rolling" because the program introduces new school cohorts each year and takes pre-intervention data for each school. Cohort size ranges between 150 and 200 schools per year. Data are collected on enrollment (reported by cohort) and attendance in addition to a range of process indicators. Although CRS/Ghana had originally planned to collect dropout data, this indicator has been eliminated because there was not an efficient

collection method for such information in place. An m&e Program Officer and Data Entry Clerk work exclusively for the education program.

In FY97, CRS/Ghana commissioned a study of the status of primary education in the three northern regions of the country. The purpose of the study was to provide CRS with a clearer understanding of the current environment for primary education in the North, and to identify possible areas of intervention and opportunities for partnership and collaboration with other NGOs.

Discussion of Results⁵:

In the section that follows, results are discussed by intervention type. The differing nature of each country program makes comparison across countries difficult. However, a review of all country program experiences with a particular intervention type can yield a general snapshot of the role that such an intervention can play in food-assisted education programs.

Generally, description of results falls into two categories. First, impact and outcome-level results such as changes in enrollment, attendance, dropout and promotion are described. Although this data is described in the context of school feeding activities, it represents outcomes achieved by the range of education activities implemented by each country program.

Impact and outcome-level results are followed by descriptions, by intervention, of program outputs between FY97-99. Most intervention types are broadly acknowledged by the education community to have some effect on educational outcomes, although their specific contribution is generally difficult to isolate when reviewing enrollment, progress, achievement or attendance data as a whole. It is possible that an impact evaluation could correlate school enrollment, attendance, progress or achievement data with results from specific interventions (such as level of community participation, quality of school infrastructure or child health or nutritional status). However, more specific information regarding each of these components would be necessary than is currently reported by CRS.

School Feeding (primary level):

Primary school feeding occurs in all four major Title II FAE programs. Feeding either occurs as a hot meal at noon or as a mid-morning meal (Haiti).⁶ In Ghana and Haiti, teachers and local parent committees organized specifically for this purpose manage school meal programs. In Burkina, teachers manage canteens. In India, CRS distributes food to local operating partners, who implement a school feeding program as part of a

⁵ The data sources (ARRs and IPTTs) used to compile this summary contain important limitations. Illustrative shortcomings in the data include changes over the years in how indicators are defined and/or data collected; lack of information regarding data collection methodology; unavailable data; and data of questionable reliability. Citation and comparison of data is therefore problematic.

⁶ In its 169 'priority zone schools', CRS/Haiti has facilitated access to improved stoves to expedite meal preparation and decrease environmental impact.

broader primary school program. In all countries, food is prepared daily by parents or teachers (India). Communities are expected to contribute nominal fees, condiments, supplementary ingredients, and/or cooking utensils. Teachers and parent committees receive training in hygiene and nutrition (cooks), food storage, and food management. In Ghana, schools that do not comply with basic management and delivery requirements are suspended from the program until they can demonstrate compliance.

| Country | # primary schools served FY99 |
|--------------|-------------------------------|
| Burkina Faso | 2,048 |
| Ghana | 763 |
| Haiti | 567 |
| India | 2,387 (includes boarding) |

Primary School Enrollment

In Ghana and Burkina Faso, indicator performance tracking tables (IPTTs) show that enrollment increased in program schools. The Ghana IPTT reports a 48% enrollment increase between baseline⁷ and the 1998-99 school year (FY99). Between FY97 and FY99, CRS/Ghana reports an enrollment increase of 5%. Burkina monitoring data show a 2% increase in overall enrollment between fiscal years 97 and 98 (FY99 data not yet available). CRS/India and CRS/Haiti do not report enrollment data.

| Country | Enrollment Increase since FY97 |
|---------|--------------------------------|
| Ghana | 5% (through FY99) |
| Burkina | 2% (through FY98) |

Indicator Performance Tracking Tables indicate that in Burkina Faso, girls' enrollment in program schools increased 12% between baseline⁸ and 1997-98. Also in Burkina, girls' enrollment as a percentage of boys' increased from 54% at baseline to 56% in 1998 (FY99 figures not yet available). A Burkina monitoring report for FY98⁹ indicates that in sample schools, girls' enrollment rates increased 11% between FY96 and FY98, compared with a national increase of 7% for the same period. The CRS/Ghana FY99 IPTT indicates that by FY99 girls' enrollment in program schools had increased 44% over baseline (from an average enrollment of 70 at inception of the program to an average enrollment in FY99 of 101) yet decreased 5% between FY97 and FY99. This decrease may indicate enrollment stabilization as the program matures, since typically, enrollment rises dramatically after inception of the program, then declines slightly, though at a higher level than baseline, once the novelty of the program wanes.

⁷ CRS/Ghana baseline enrollment data is taken on a yearly basis with each entering school cohort. The 'baseline' figure represents the average of the average enrollment for each cohort, beginning with FY 95.

⁸ As stated in the CRS/Burkina IPTT: Baseline data for FY96 was collected in 1997.

⁹ CRS/Burkina Programme d'Appui a l'Education de Base, Unite du Suivi et de l' Evaluation *Principales Statistiques et Resultats Scolaires Relatifs aux 349 Ecoles Ciblees, Annee 1997-98: Comparaison avec l'Anne de Base 1995-96*, p.7.

| Country | Girls' Enrollment Increase baseline-FY98 |
|--------------|--|
| Ghana | 50% |
| Burkina Faso | 12% |

When reviewing enrollment (and attendance) data, it should be noted that in some country programs, school feeding (and in Ghana, take-home) activities had been established in targeted communities well before the official inception of the FAE program. In these cases, baseline data do not necessarily represent a 'pre-intervention' figure, but only a pre-FAE program figure. Given that enrollment increases are greatest at inception of the activity, it is possible that "baseline" figures cited by programs already reflect higher enrollment/attendance than would have been found had the activity been newly introduced, thereby yielding a smaller percentage increase in enrollment in later years and obscuring the 'true' enrollment progress achieved by the program. No details regarding whether or which targeted communities were new to or pre-existed the FAE initiative are contained in the ARRs, IPTTs, or midterm reviews consulted for this study.

Primary School Attendance

In all country programs, monitoring data indicate that schools participating in a FAE program demonstrated a high, sustained attendance rate. Typically, attendance rates improve relative to baseline or comparison schools upon inception of a FAE program, then level off at a higher sustained rate than non-program schools. For example, the CRS/Ghana IPTT indicates that for fiscal years 97 and 98, average monthly attendance averaged 77% of students enrolled in program schools, compared with a 69% attendance rate at baseline (FY96). Burkina Faso monitoring data indicate an 89% attendance rate for 1998-99, compared with an 88% attendance rate for non-meal control schools in 1997-98. India data for 1997-98 and 1998-99 school years indicate that an average 86% of enrolled students attend 80% of annual school days, with no control school data available. Haiti data indicate that attendance remained steady at 88% and 90% in priority and general schools, respectively, during the 1997-98 and 1998-99 school years.

| Country | Average attendance fiscal years 98,99 | Comparison |
|---------|--|--------------------|
| Ghana | Average daily FY98,99: 77% | Control FY96: 69% |
| Burkina | FY99: 89% (FY98 figures not available) | Baseline FY97: 88% |
| Haiti | FY98, FY99: 89% | None available |
| India | FY98,99: 86% | Baseline FY97: 84% |

CRS/Ghana annual results reports indicate that the average monthly attendance rate for girls in program schools increased 32% between fiscal years 97 and 99. In FY 97, the average monthly attendance rate for girls in program schools was 41%, while the rate at control schools was 38%. In FY98, average attendance for girls in program schools rose from 41% to 46%. In 1998-99, average attendance rates rose from 46% to 54%.

Attendance data for girls indicates that in FY99, Ghanaian girls' attendance at program schools was 38% higher than control school attendance figures (54% attendance for program schools as compared with 39% for controls). No girls' attendance figures in regular program schools are reported for Burkina Faso. In India, the percentage of girls attending primary school at least 80% of annual school days increased from an average of 86% in 1996-97 to an average of 88% in 1998-99.

| Country | FY99 Girls' attendance | Comparison |
|---------|------------------------|-------------------|
| Ghana | 54% | FY99 control: 39% |
| Burkina | No data | -- |
| Haiti | No data | -- |
| India | 88% | Baseline: 86% |

Primary School Progress

Three CRS country programs track school progress. India tracks retention and promotion rates, Haiti tracks pupil flow rates, and Burkina tracks dropout rates. India data indicate that retention rates have remained steady at 94% of children enrolled from the 1996-97 baseline through 1998-99. Girls' retention is slightly higher, at a constant rate of 95%. Dropout rates in India are highest after grades 1 and 5, relative to other grades. India promotion rates have declined relative to baseline, from 90% of enrolled children being promoted to the next highest grade in 1996-97, to 84% in 1998-99. Girls' promotion rates also declined, though to a lesser degree, with baseline rates of 90% and 1998-99 rates of 87%. (Declines in promotion rates may be more a reflection of more rigorous data collection methods imposed in FY98 than of actual declines in promotion.) In Burkina, girls' dropout declined 13% between 1995-96 and 1997-98, from 8.34% to 7.28%, while boys' dropout declined 7% in the same period, from 7.56% to 7%. No figures are reported for Haiti.

| Country | Baseline drop out | Most recent drop out |
|---------|----------------------------------|---|
| India | FY 97: 6% FY97 girls: 5% | FY99: 6% FY99 girls: 5% |
| Burkina | FY96 girls: 8.34% boys: 7.56% | FY98 girls: 7.28% (-13%) boys: 7.00% (-7%) |
| Haiti | Not reported | Not reported |

Exit examination pass rates

Two country programs, Burkina Faso and Haiti, follow exit examination pass rates in targeted schools. In Haiti, exit examination pass rates for boys and girls in priority schools were 74% and 56% for fiscal years 98 and 99 respectively, compared with a national average of 65% and 45% for the same years. Thus, although scores in Haiti declined, they were higher in CRS priority schools than the national average for both years. In Burkina, exit exam pass rates rose 7% for boys yet declined 14% for girls, compared with baseline (FY98 pass rates were 30% for girls and 50% for boys, compared

with a baseline of 35% for girls and 46% for boys). In both countries, declines might be attributable to changes in the exam.

| Country | Previous Pass Rate | Most Recent Pass Rate |
|--------------|--|--|
| Haiti | 74% CRS priority schools (FY98) 65% national average (FY98) | 56% CRS priority schools (FY99) 45% national average (FY99) |
| Burkina Faso | 35% girls (FY96) 46% boys (FY96) | 30% girls (FY98) 50% boys (FY98) |

Mid-term review (MTR) findings: Burkina and Ghana MTR interviews with teachers, students and parents indicate that school meal programs have a positive effect on primary school enrollment, although in the Burkina MTR sample provinces, increased enrollment was attributed more to local MOE pressure on parents than to the school meal program. Also in Burkina, school meal programs were not seen to counteract the principal obstacles to increased enrollment, namely *cost* (both school costs and opportunity costs of lost child labor) and *lack of a relevant curriculum*. In both Burkina and Ghana, meal programs were seen to improve attendance significantly, and to improve the community's image of the school. MTRs for both Ghana and Burkina state that community members generally have little oversight of food management, as this is left primarily to teachers, although CRS/Ghana recently took steps to improve community participation in food management. MTR findings in Burkina indicate little community interest or ability to sustain a school meal program if CRS withdraws its support and suggests a stronger emphasis on community awareness raising and participation in the program if this goal is to be pursued.

Important considerations for data evaluation: In some areas (for example Ghana), school feeding programs may draw children from neighboring non-program schools, thus heightening enrollment in program schools to the detriment of neighboring non-program schools. This should be accounted for as 'enrollment transfer' in monitoring documentation. Also, in some areas, non-enrolled children (for example, younger siblings) receive meals. Thus 'numbers of children receiving a meal' data and official school attendance data may conflict. In addition, some children attend school until the meal is served each day and then leave, thus diminishing possible educational effects.

Take-home rations

Take Home Rations (THRs) are used by Burkina Faso, Ghana and India (among some operating partners) programs as an incentive to increase girls' attendance in particular. Monthly rations are given to girls who attend 85% (Ghana), 90% (Burkina) or 80% (India) of the school days in a given month. Rations typically consist of beans and/or grains and/or oil or salt. In Ghana, rations are distributed to the mothers of eligible girls at month's end, to stimulate greater parental involvement. In all programs, the THR activity is accompanied with an IEC campaign designed to encourage parents to send girls to school.

Enrollment

CRS/Ghana Annual Results Reports indicate significant increases in girls' enrollment in ration schools over control schools. Average 1997-1998 girls' enrollment figures in ration schools increased 16% over 1996-97 figures (girls' average 1997-98 enrollment in ration schools was 116, compared to 98 in 1996-97). Average 1998-99 girls' enrollment figures in ration schools decreased 10% below 1997-98 figures (girls' average 1998-99 enrollment in ration schools was 104, compared to 116 in 1998). Burkina Faso's THR component is relatively new. For the first three provinces that participated in the component, there was a 27% increase in girls' enrollment between 1997-98 and 1998-99, compared to a 5% increase for boys in these provinces for the same period. India does not report on girls' enrollment data for operating partners having a THR component.

| Country | Girls' enrollment increase in THR schools |
|---------|---|
| Ghana | 6% increase FY97-99 |
| Burkina | 27% increase FY98-99 |
| India | No data available |

Attendance

CRS/Ghana ARRs and IPTTs indicate that in FY97, girls' attendance at ration schools was 50% higher than that in control schools (the percentage of girls achieving 85% monthly attendance in control schools was 38%, compared to 57% in ration schools). In 1997-98, the percentage of girls achieving 85% attendance rose from 57% to 59%. In 1999, this figure increased from 59% to 70%. Only 39% of girls in control schools achieved 85% monthly attendance in 1998-99. In Burkina Faso, girls' attendance at ration schools improved 6% over FY98 non-meal control school figures, from 81% to 86%. For the FY97-FY99 period, girls' attendance at ration schools increased 23%, from an average of 57% girls achieving 85% monthly attendance, to an average of 70% girls.

| Country | Girls 85% monthly attendance with THR | Comparison |
|---------|---------------------------------------|-------------------|
| Ghana | FY99: 70% | FY99 control: 39% |
| Burkina | FY99: 86% | FY98 control: 81% |
| India | No data available | No data available |

Mid-term Review Findings: Burkina and Ghana MTRs reported the parental belief that THRs are an effective enrollment and attendance incentive for girls. Parents in both countries questioned the absence of equal THR support for boys, while parents in Burkina articulated many social and cultural barriers to girls' education that outweigh the THR incentive. In Burkina and India, parents stated that while food was an incentive for sending girls to school, girls' continued attendance was largely determined by demonstrated academic success. Ration calculation, tracking and distribution was reported problematic in both Burkina and Ghana, with the recommendation that trackers be better trained, use better data collection techniques, and have more time to accomplish the task. The Burkina MTR reported that in all schools visited, *all* girls received a THR, instead of only those who attended 80% time, thus limiting the efficacy of the intervention to serve as an incentive for strong attendance. In response, CRS/Burkina notes that "this phenomenon occurs only in schools which have a fewer number of girls in relation to boys (for example 5 girls for 30

boys). In this case, some schools will give THR to all girls instead of excluding one or two."¹⁰

Infrastructure improvement

CRS programs in Ghana, Burkina and Haiti each support school infrastructure improvements. Burkina Faso uses a *food for work* (ffw) approach to supporting community construction or renovation of schools, preschools, storage facilities, teacher housing, kitchens and chimneys, school wells and latrines. While FFP contributes food resources, other donors such as UNICEF, DANIDA and PACEB (Canadian Education Support Program) support materials acquisition and construction plans. Monitoring documents indicate that by September 1999, CRS had built or repaired classroom spaces in 603 out of 750 targeted for completion by September 2001. Also by this date, CRS had equipped 170 schools with latrines and 26 schools with potable water sources, toward 'life of activity' totals of 250 and 40, respectively.

CRS/Haiti and CRS/Ghana use a *small project* approach to infrastructure improvement. In Haiti, community Parent Teacher Associations (PTAs) submit a project proposal for school improvement after receiving CRS training in small project management. Successful proposals are awarded a modest sum of money to be used for materials purchase. To receive support, communities must demonstrate broad participation in the selection and implementation of the project, and contribute at least 20% of the total to project realization. No infrastructure projects were reported in fiscal year 1997. Based on the CRS/Haiti IPTT, in FY98, 20 or 17% of CRS/Haiti's 'priority' schools were involved with small projects, as compared with the targeted 10%. As of September 1999, 35 or 21% of 169 'priority' schools were involved with small projects, as compared to the targeted 25% for FY99. In FY99, CRS/Haiti assisted in the completion of 15 small projects (including latrines, water cisterns, school bookstores, building reparations and certain structural improvements), while communities initiated an additional 20 projects with no outside assistance from CRS (no descriptions for these projects are reported by CRS).

In Ghana, all program schools are eligible to apply for infrastructure support. Teachers and communities learn about the program through their contact with CRS and/or MOE liaison personnel, and submit letters of interest. CRS and MOE personnel visit applicant communities and make selections based on need and assessed community commitment. CRS program officers then facilitate a 'PLA mobilization meeting'. During the meeting, communities develop infrastructure improvement action plans and timelines. CRS reviews plans and formalizes the process with a letter, sent to communities and to local MOE representatives, outlining both community and CRS responsibilities. Improvement projects that focus on school infrastructure improvement involve a shared responsibility: when a school that has applied to CRS for infrastructure support has built the school structure up to the roofing level (in line with CRS specifications), then CRS/Ghana supplies roofing materials and cement to plaster.

¹⁰ As stated in an email from the Education Program Manager, regarding draft document review, 10/31/00.

To date, CRS/Ghana support has consisted of follow-up visits by facilitators, roofing materials (which are procured based on verification that communities have begun construction of classrooms and/or teacher dwellings) and, in FY99, classroom furniture. According to its FY99 Indicator Performance Tracking Table (IPTT), CRS/Ghana has provided infrastructure assistance to 146 of its program schools since 1997, with plans to reach a total of 225 schools by September 2001. Specifically, CRS/Ghana facilitated the construction of 64 classroom blocks and 4 teacher teachers' quarters in FY98, and 24 classroom blocks and 8 teachers' quarters in FY99. As a follow-up (in 70% of cases) or alternative (in 30% of cases) to construction in some communities, CRS supplied 46 program schools with classroom furniture in FY99. Pre-fabricated furniture requires little community input.¹¹

| Country | Total schools with infrastructure improvements 1997-99 | Life of Activity Target (by September 2001) |
|--------------|--|---|
| Burkina Faso | 603 (classrooms) 170 (latrines) 26 (potable water) | 750 (classrooms) 80% achieved 250 (latrines) 68% achieved 40 (potable water) 65% achieved |
| Haiti | 55 (includes independent community improvements) | Figure not reported |
| Ghana | 146 | 225 65% achieved |
| India | No infrastructure support data reported | |

Midterm review results:

Mid-term evaluations for all three countries found community-based infrastructure improvement activities an effective means of involving the community in school quality improvement, primarily because poor infrastructure is a highly visible need that a range of community members can easily act upon. Improved infrastructure, in turn, improved community members' opinion of the school, encouraged enrollment and attendance, and served as an initial means of encouraging broader community participation in local education issues. Currently, no data correlating school attendance, enrollment, achievement or progress with completion of school infrastructure activities exists among CRS programs.

MTRs for Ghana and Burkina cited delayed materials delivery as a hindrance to community progress and enthusiasm in small project completion. Ghana, Haiti and Burkina MTRs also suggest that more regular facilitator follow-up of small project progress is important for sustainability, community empowerment, capacity building and quality control purposes. The need for greater facilitator contact with communities implies, in turn, a need for more facilitators and therefore greater financial resources for implementing this component successfully. The Ghana MTR discouraged use of pre-built classroom furniture, as this brought little potential for community participation. However,

¹¹ See MTR and FY99ARR.

it also stated that community-build furniture "can be the end product of successful community mobilization."

Parental/Community Involvement Activities

All four country programs engage in community involvement activities. Ghana, Burkina and Haiti focus on PTA development. In India, community participation activities are more diverse and less formalized. CRS/India aims to increase the community participation component of the programs it supports.

In Ghana, PTA development activities represent one component of the larger FAE program and as such, are initiated in the same manner as the other program activities--through a letter of community interest, selection by Ghana MOE staff and CRS program officers, a discussion with CRS program officers regarding community and CRS roles and responsibilities, and an initial PRA/PLA activity that reviews community perceptions, desires and issues regarding schooling. After these general ESP activities, CRS requires that the community democratically elect PTA/SMCs. Then, PTA/SMCs receive training from CRS.

According to the IPTT, impact on PTA development is indicated by the "number of communities having functional PTA/SMCs (School Management Committees)," with 'functional PTAs' being defined as those that "democratically elect officers, meet at least once per school term, record minutes from each PTA meeting and execute at least one community-initiated and community based development project per school year." Currently, CRS/Ghana strives to initiate PTA development in 45 communities per year, and reach a life of project total of 225 communities.

No PTA development activities were undertaken in Ghana during the 1996-97 school year. ARRs indicated that in FY98, CRS "clarified the roles of PTA/SMCs" in 48 communities. In FY99, CRS/Ghana carried out PRA/PLA in 32 communities and conducted community-focused "PTA sensitization" activities¹² in an additional 46. IPTTs and ARRs do not report on the annual or cumulative number of PTAs who meet "functional" criteria, on the efficacy or nature of training, or on the nature/success of PTA/SMC activities.

In Haiti, PTA development activities are also a central component of the CRS program. PTAs are a new concept in Haiti. Thus, CRS/Haiti activities include first community information sessions regarding PTA purpose and activities; second, support in PTA officer election activities; third, ongoing PTA development; and fourth, PTA support in developing and implementing community-based school improvement projects. Ongoing development includes general management training, health-hygiene-nutrition training,

¹² Community sensitization activities are defined by CRS/Ghana as "a less methodological approach [than PRA/PLA] with essentially the same result. Preparing for work with a PTA involves sensitizing the community to the value and potential of the PTA. By calling upon the community this way, work with the PTA can be focused on the community's needs, allowing the formalities of the PTA meeting to come to life through action (small projects)." *From an email from the CRS/Ghana Education Program Manager containing editorial comments regarding this document, dated October 25 2000.*

and connection with a broader network of PTAs and other education NGOs. The HHN training and School Health Day components of PTA development are discussed in the HHN section.

In FY97, CRS facilitated the establishment of PTAs in 236 schools (56% of all program schools). Of these, only 40% were estimated by an independent NGO assessment to have actually been "functional" (defined as having held meetings and initiated activities), based on sampling data. None initiated community projects in FY97. In FY98, according to the FY98 IPTT and ARR, CRS/Haiti both reinforced newly formed PTAs and encouraged the formation of additional PTAs, with a total of 80 or 67% of priority schools having established PTAs, and 56% of these PTAs being defined as "functional". Seventeen percent or 20 schools/PTAs had initiated small projects. In FY99, 121 or 72% of priority schools had elected PTA officers, and 69% of schools had held at least one PTA meeting per semester. Also in FY99, 21% or 35 PTAs were involved with small projects.

Burkina Faso's approach to community involvement includes first an IEC campaign to raise parental awareness about the importance of schooling, second a training of trainers activity for PTA development facilitators (who are also provincial controllers), and finally the implementation of PTA training. CRS/BF began this component in FY97 by collecting baseline data concerning parental knowledge, attitudes and practices regarding education. Based on this information, CRS convened a 'reflection workshop' in FY98 to determine IEC themes and practices. Also in FY98, CRS implemented 2 TOT workshops for provincial controllers. Based on these activities, CRS strives to create 70 'School Animation Units' (CAE, or subcommittees of PTAs) per year. Each CAE is composed of 6 people responsible for carrying out awareness activities on the different Education Program components. In FY99, controllers organized information sessions for CAE members in 297 communities in 20 provinces. In 7 of these provinces, CAEs organized debates, community games and theatrical presentations.

Unlike the other country programs, CRS/India does not support a specific set of community development activities, and does not collect community-related output or outcome data. Instead, CRS currently works through its large network of partner organizations to support partners' efforts to involve communities. Currently, some CRS/India partner schools have functional education committees. Others work with existing groups such as Mahila Mandals (women's groups), youth groups, and other community groups such as savings groups, to mobilize support for education. Specifically, CRS-supported partner activities involving communities include community input to establishing and maintaining ECD programs, fee payment, partner training in community outreach, and parental participation in monthly meetings. CRS also supports many boarding schools. Currently there is little community participation at these schools.

CRS/India is in the process of shifting its program from an institution-based to a community-based model. This shift will increase the level of community-focused work implemented by partner agencies in the future. Also, it is likely that output and outcome data will be available regarding community development in the future.

Mid-term evaluation findings

All midterm reports acknowledged the important role that community participation/parental support for education activities do or could play in CRS education programs. In Ghana, the evaluation team found that more ESP communities than expected possessed a "functioning" PTA, yet questioned the number of these that were elected and run according to democratic principles, suggesting that the criterion of democratic function be reviewed within the context of appropriate cultural practices in the community. The Ghana MTR also noted that an information tracking system for PTA activities is not yet in place. Finally, the MTR recommended that the PTA development component be supported by a comprehensive strategy and by practical tools, frequent contact and support. In Haiti, MTR observations acknowledged the difficulty of establishing a functional, democratic PTA system and suggested greater participation by local officials. It also suggested that CRS assist communities with PTA legalization, training, and ongoing financial viability. MTR observations for Burkina stated that the efficacy of the IEC campaign among parents and students was generally acknowledged, yet difficult to isolate and attribute. The MTR also observed that the level of 'functionality' among groups surveyed was highly variable. Suggestions for Burkina included the need for a stronger emphasis on the IEC component of the community participation activity; continued improvement of education quality in general; and income generation activities for parents' groups. MTR findings in India called for an increase in partner linkage activities with other community organizations; identification of community members (as opposed to teachers) to assist with food preparation; and increased support for the government-mandated Village Education Committees, which are currently only marginally functional.

Health, Hygiene and Nutrition Activities

Two CRS country programs--Haiti and Burkina Faso--implement HHN activities. Health, Hygiene and Nutrition Activities include Vitamin A supplementation, iodine supplementation (Burkina Faso) and anthelmintic treatment, as well as HHN education. Results reported consist primarily of output and qualitative data.

In Haiti, these activities are complemented by First Aid training and kits for PTA members. Also in Haiti, HHN education encompasses both PTA training and PTA-sponsored School Health Days. In FY97, CRS/Haiti distributed vitamin A to children aged 3-7 in 300 'priority' and 'intermediate' program schools (71% of total program schools, and 100% of the CRS target for this year). In FY98, CRS/Haiti reached 210 schools (55% of total) with vitamin A, falling short of its target of distribution to 100% of schools due to national shortages of Vitamin A. In FY99, 350 (82%) of the scheduled 429 targeted schools received vitamin A, again due to national shortages. No de-worming medication was distributed in FY97. In FY98, CRS distributed anthelmintics to students age 3 and up in 155 program schools (41% of total and of target). During FY99, CRS surpassed its goal of distributing de-worming medicine to all 429 priority and intermediate schools by distributing the medicine to certain general schools as well, for a total of 444 schools.

CRS/Haiti supported PTAs in sponsoring School Health Days in 32% of priority schools (as opposed to the targeted 40%) schools in FY97, 24% of priority schools (as opposed to the targeted 25%) in FY98, and 17% of priority schools (as opposed to 25%) in FY99. HHN training for PTAs did not occur in FY97. It occurred in 15% of priority schools in FY98. By FY99, 37% of all priority schools had received PTA training in HHN. In addition in FY98, 17% of priority school PTAs had initiated small projects. By FY99, 21% or 35 PTAs were involved with small projects.

No HHN activities took place in Burkina Faso in FY97. In FY98 CRS finalized an agreement with the MOE in which the MOE (World Bank) purchased some of the medications, and CRS purchased additional ones. In FY99, CRS/Burkina reached 1269 of a targeted 1274 schools with de-worming medication, 838 of a targeted 827 schools with vitamin A, and 431 of a targeted 447 schools with iodine.

HHN education began in FY98 with teacher training. No data on this activity is provided in the CRS/Burkina FY98 IPTT or ARR. In FY99, CRS/BF held two workshops for provincial education and health workers to create a National Health and Nutrition Guide for teachers. It held one TOT workshop for guide implementation. CRS/BF also organized 'Sensitization Days' in four provinces involved in micronutrient distribution. Also in FY99, CRS/BF initiated a school health education pilot project in one province, in collaboration with Helen Keller International.

Mid-term Evaluation Findings

No midterm findings were reported for the HHN component in Burkina Faso. The Haiti MTR stated that beneficiaries welcomed and appreciated the medicines they received, and found that HHN activities for PTAs were useful. It also acknowledged the contribution of School Health Days to general HHN awareness among the school community and to community opinion of CRS. School Health Days were seen as an effective means of PTA development.

Teacher development activities

Two country programs, Haiti and India, support teacher development activities. In Haiti, these activities are part of a broader 'quality of education' package which includes distribution of teacher/student attendance registers in selected (Ed 2004) priority zone schools and teacher training in their use; distribution of the primary school curriculum in all non-public priority schools in collaboration with the MOE, and introduction of distance learning in selected (Ed 2004) priority schools.

Teacher development and distance learning components are delivered in collaboration with the 'Education 2004' project, funded by USAID and managed by AED. *Ed 2004* aims to improve the quality of education in Haitian primary schools. It provides pedagogy training for teachers and directors, radio-based distance education in Math and Creole, and other education materials and supplies. Three clusters of CRS schools (16 schools in all) participated in the project during FY99.

Currently, CRS/Haiti reports no data regarding the teacher development or distance education elements of its work. It does report data regarding the use of CRS attendance registers. According to CRS/Haiti, registers motivate teachers to be present and on time, because it is teachers' responsibility to record attendance. Registers also allow teachers to indicate whether absences are illness or non-illness related so that CRS may track the efficacy of its HHN activities in reducing illness-related absences. However, currently, no data correlating illness-related absence with HHN activities is available.

In FY97, 60 nonpublic priority schools used CRS-designed attendance registers. In FY98, CRS distributed registers to all 120 priority zone schools and reported that 99% of schools used them regularly. In FY99, CRS distributed registers to all nonpublic priority schools, and also to those public schools in the priority zone that did not have an MOE attendance register. CRS reports that in FY99, 97% of all priority schools used the register regularly.

CRS/India has adopted an incremental teacher development strategy, which addresses training needs first at the ECD level, then grade by grade at the primary level. ECD-level teacher development activities are discussed in the ECD section. No primary teacher development activities were undertaken in FY97. In FY98, CRS/India implemented a training needs assessment among grade 1 teachers. In FY99, CRS conducted training for master trainers as well as grade 1 and 2 teachers in child-centered and activity-based teaching and learning methods. A total of 769 primary school teachers received an average of 12 days' training in FY99.

Because CRS/India supports a broad variety of implementing partners, each with its own program and approach, CRS/India used no one approach or methodology for teacher development during the FY97-99 period. Rather, the Calcutta zone uses a 'training of trainers' model, while the Mumbai zone relies on specialized education NGO assistance, and the Uttar Pradesh zone uses trainers from a UNICEF-supported approach. CRS/India is in the process of refining its teacher development component to include a more systematic approach to teachers' professional development. The new system will focus on a school cluster approach, child-centered methods including materials development, increased training for Master Teacher Trainers, more frequent training sessions, and increased classroom-level support.

Mid-term review findings: The India MTR acknowledged that training in activity-based methods and development of teaching and learning materials had contributed to improved classroom practice among primary school teachers. Teachers surveyed indicated that CRS-sponsored teacher development activities were valuable, particularly since in many cases, teachers have no other opportunities for professional development. Particular training needs were articulated among multigrade and boarding school teachers, who face added challenges. MTR recommendations included more frequent training opportunities and specialized training for multigrade (in classroom management) and boarding school (in remedial education techniques) teachers. The Haiti MTR noted CRS/Haiti's lack of data regarding this component and criticized CRS/Haiti's relinquishment of school

selection, training implementation, and materials distribution to *Ed 2004*, recommending that CRS/Haiti's management of this component be more hands-on.

IEC campaign

Information, Education and Communication (IEC) campaigns are implemented in Burkina Faso, India and Ghana. Campaigns are used to build support for program objectives such as girls' education and increased community participation in education.

In India, IEC campaigns aim to increase community support for girls' education. Activities implemented by some partners included puppetry, street plays, other interactive media, and house-to-house visits. Currently, CRS/India reports no specific information regarding IEC campaign outputs or results.

The Burkina Faso IEC component is designed to support the health and community/parental participation components of the program. CRS/BF began IEC work in 1997 with the hiring of an IEC specialist. Initial activities included elaboration and testing of illustrated messages regarding both HHN practices (12 illustrations) and the importance of school (10 illustrations). Most FY97 IEC work focused on the parental awareness component of the program. In FY98, IEC activities involved continued materials development (150 picture sets, 384 educational drawings, 75 animation guides); an IEC strategy design workshop and strategy finalization; and one 'train the trainer' workshop for community level IEC activities (to be implemented by PTAs). In FY99, IEC activities included creation of additional IEC materials (2715 educational drawings, 450 picture boxes, 75 bulletin boards, 15 community awareness guides); 300 organization/education sessions for PTAs in 20 provinces; and exposure of 25,000 community members to IEC messages.

CRS/Ghana also implements IEC activities to support its education activities. Activities to date include the design and broadcast in FY98 of a radio show discussing the importance of education in general and girls' education in particular. Songs were written and recorded to accompany the broadcast. The show was translated into four local languages. Posters complementing the radio broadcasts were also planned. No specific output or outcome data regarding the CRS/Ghana IEC component are currently reported.

Early Childhood Development Activities

Early Childhood Development activities (ECD) are supported by Ghana and India programs. Both programs deliver mid-day meals to the ECD centers they support. In India, ECD teacher training accompanies meals.

In India, ECD programs are based in the community, rely heavily on community contributions and are housed in upgraded family facilities. ECD teachers are usually women from the community. Fees for running the schools and paying teacher salaries are collected from parents. In some cases, Village Education Committees have been mobilized to assist with fee collection. CRS partner organizations distribute food, often in small quantities and often on a week-to-week basis. CRS offers training to a portion of teachers in the ECD centers it supports. Training is delivered using a variety of

methodologies as described above. All training includes a focus on child-centered, activity-based teaching and learning methods, as well as materials development. Training is phased and incremental. In FY98, 533 teachers from 722 partner ECD programs received training. In addition, 155 Master Trainers received training for follow-up and ongoing support to ECD teachers in a cluster-based strategy, resulting in approximately one Master Trainer for every 10 ECD centers. In FY99, 464 teachers received training.

Baseline attendance rates, taken in FY97, for CRS/India's ECD centers were 75% total, 75% for girls, and 77% for ST/SC/OBC groups. Attendance rates for FY98 were 66% total, 69% girls, and 65% for ST/SC/OBC groups. In FY99, attendance rates were reported as 75% total and 76% for girls. No attendance data for ST/SC/OBC groups were reported in FY99.

Data indicate a lower attendance rate for children in ECD centers relative to children in other types of schools. However, retention rates are high. FY97 retention figures indicate that 92% of girls and 94% of children from st/sc/obc groups, enrolled in the ECD program returned for a second year, while 79% of girls and 78% of st/sc/obc groups were promoted to first grade. In FY98, 84% of girls and 86% of st/sc/obc groups, re-enrolled in the ECD program for a second year, while 83% of girls and 84% of st/sc/obc groups were promoted to first grade. In FY99, 91% of girls (no st/sc/obc group figures reported) re-enrolled, while 96% of girls (no st/sc/obc group figures reported) were promoted to first grade. CRS/India reports an increase in primary school enrollment, particularly among girls, in communities having an ECD program.

CRS/Ghana supports a feeding program at selected preschool centers in the Northern Region. In FY 1997, targeted preschools reported a 75% monthly attendance rate. In FY98, monthly attendance rose to 94% of those enrolled. In FY99, average monthly attendance was reported as 80% of those enrolled. CRS/Ghana reports an increase in primary school enrollment, particularly among girls, in communities having an ECD program.

| Country | Average ECD Attendance Rates FY97-99 |
|---------|--|
| Ghana | 83% |
| India | Total: 72% Girls: 73% ST/SC/OBC: 71% |

Partner capacity building

Partner capacity building activities are described as a discrete program component only in India, although informal capacity building activities with local MOE and other collaborating partners take place in all country programs. Partner capacity building is particularly important in India, since CRS does not directly implement any activities in this country program, working through a large number of partner organizations instead.

Apart from the individual intervention types supported by CRS, partner capacity building can be described as the overarching strategy for CRS/India's education programming. The strategy aims to strengthen organizational capacity at the *Cooperating Partner*, *Operating Partner* and *educational institution* levels. In this way, CRS hopes to enhance partners' ability to work with community groups.

In FY98, CRS engaged in an institutional profiling activity with 2714 institutions to determine partners' capacity building needs. In addition, CRS supported increased education staffing levels both at zonal CRS offices (7 new staff in FY97) and among *Cooperating Partners* (6 in FY97 and 36 in FY99). In FY98, CRS/India hired a technical advisor in Delhi for better coordination and support. Capacity building activities for these groups focused on training in participatory and MIS data collection, micro planning, school cluster development, teacher support and community outreach. In addition, CRS and partners continue to build linkages with other state and local education organizations.

Analysis of Results

USAID's recent shift to a strong results orientation in its programming has undoubtedly resulted in a greater awareness among CRS FAE program designers of the importance of sound program design, sustainability and quality monitoring and evaluation systems. In addition, FFP requests for demonstrated education impacts have facilitated CRS' transition from a school feeding model to an education quality model, a move which has been beneficial for the agency as a whole. Nonetheless, CRS education staff have faced a steep learning curve during the recent DAP period, as they struggled first to develop education programs that met with USAID performance expectations and later to make programs more feasible, appropriate or technically sound.

Mid-program adaptations occurred in each country program and at CRS headquarters. Country programs expanded their number of education staff and hired educators for these positions. At headquarters as well, CRS created an Education Technical Advisor position (1997), intended to support all education programs and to nurture a budding education sector capacity for the agency as a whole. All country programs made adjustments, either to their baseline data and/or collection methodology (Burkina, India), to their targeting (Haiti, India), to their performance targets (Ghana) or to their indicators (Ghana, India). In addition, all country programs sought external technical assistance regarding the particular education challenges they faced, and all began to develop education monitoring and evaluation systems. Each of these activities demonstrates growing organizational commitment to, understanding of, and competency in, food-assisted education programming.

Unfortunately, organizational growth is not readily captured by the results monitoring frameworks used during this period by country programs and by FFP to evaluate program progress. The requirement that FAE program results be demonstrated primarily by the extent to which beneficiary-level impact targets have been met, while it could improve the quality and sustainability of FAE initiatives in the long run, nonetheless obscures the fact that all impacts are achieved as part of one or more change *processes*, both at the

beneficiary and at the organizational level, and that such processes often occur incrementally, over the long term. This observation is particularly relevant for CRS FAE programs.

As these programs approach the end of their first DAP cycle based on the FAE model, any true assessment of program efficacy must include a review of beneficiary-level impacts *in addition to* an evaluation of organizational capacity. Arguably, high organizational capacity scores on a final evaluation might be a better indication of future educational impacts than would moderate or inconclusive impact scores, simply because organizational capacity would be more of a constant, whereas educational impact data may not adequately reflect program progress or deficiencies.¹³

This last statement is best exemplified by the following two observations. First, *monitoring data do not conclusively reveal the extent to which FAE interventions reviewed have achieved their intended impact*. It is possible that some interventions have had greater impact, and some lesser impact, than what can be ascertained from current monitoring data. Second, *absence of conclusive impact data reveals less about the efficacy of FAE interventions than it does about the gaps and growth in CRS organizational capacity to design, implement and monitor quality FAE programming*. It is possible that, for example, given CRS' nascent experience in Education Management Information Systems (EMIS), a poor showing on an impact evaluation might be more a sign of poor monitoring and evaluation systems design than of poor programming. Likewise, the fact that HHN education had fewer demonstrable impacts than planned might be more a sign of unrealistic expectations, than of poor implementation.

The India program offers a cogent example of this. The program strives to maintain attendance, retention and promotion rates. Monitoring results indicate that the program has been largely successful in meeting this objective. Yet this achievement is only the "tip of the iceberg". These simple data obscure the potentially farther-reaching efforts undertaken by India program managers to change the emphasis of their work from an institutional to a community-focused one. An evaluation of the nature and efficacy of these changes would add significantly to an understanding of the current and potential impact of FAE programming in the India context, yet given the current results-oriented reporting format, this information is not readily accessible. India program managers recently requested that process indicators be added to their monitoring framework.

Despite the significant evolutions undergone by all country programs and the difficulty of comparing across countries, some noteworthy beneficiary-level results do emerge:

1. FAE programs do seem to encourage higher attendance and enrollment. Numbers appear to rise dramatically at program inception, then level off at a higher sustained rate than at non-program schools.

¹³ Programs demonstrating significant organizational capacity as well as promising impacts to date might be renewed with the expectation that they demonstrate more rigorous monitoring and evaluation practices and greater beneficiary-level impacts during the second FAE DAP cycle.

2. Take-home ration interventions have a particularly notable effect on girls' attendance, although they are not sufficient to overcome certain cultural or economic obstacles associated with girls' education in some environments.
3. FAE programs appear to contribute to decreased dropout rates.
4. School infrastructure improvement interventions that rely at least in part on community contributions seem to be popular with community members. They offer a promising and cost-effective means of initiating community participation in education and improving school learning environments.
5. Food assistance and other support for early child development programs appears linked to increased enrollments in primary schools that are associated with ECD programs.

In addition to these results, review of country program progress reveals important lessons learned. For example:

1. FAE monitoring and evaluation systems should be well planned in advance, should be developed according to a set of minimum technical standards, and should be appropriately funded. Particular attention should be paid to baseline design and implementation, as this is the foundation of all future monitoring and evaluation.
2. Collection of process and outcome-level data *in addition to* impact data is critical for internal monitoring and external evaluation. Efforts should be made to monitor the efficacy of each FAE program component in order to determine, at a later date, the extent to which each component contributes to the whole.
3. Community participation in the support of FAE programs (including but not limited to participation in food management) offers promising prospects for the sustainability and impact of school quality improvement initiatives. Conversely, FAE initiatives are difficult to sustain without community participation.
4. Effective FAE programs require that at least a portion of the staff be trained educators.
5. Strategy development and program planning should occur continuously and extend beyond any given DAP period.

In addition to reviewing promising results and lessons learned, it is helpful to note the major challenges faced by FAE programs since 1995. Two of the greatest challenges include:

- a) the development of rigorous monitoring and evaluation practices (described in various contexts throughout this review);
- b) the development of complementary funding for FAE activities.

Although a review of fundraising activities was not part of the present study, CRS did, in 1999, commission a survey of its education programs' complementary funding activities since 1995.¹⁴ The following statements are based on this review.

¹⁴ Janke and Pittman, *Beyond Food for Peace: A Survey of CRS Education Funding Experience and Recommendations for the Future*, 2000.

- As of 1999, most FFP-supported programs surveyed (including the four country programs reviewed here as well as programs in Benin, Liberia, Sierra Leone and Sudan) had received some non-FFP support.
- In most cases, complementary support came in the form of small awards from private, primarily Catholic, donors.
- Twenty-five percent of USAID/FFP-supported education programs had received support from more than one non-FFP donor.
- No FFP-supported programs surveyed had received support from multilateral donors.
- Two country programs, Ghana and Haiti, had received significant support from USAID missions to implement education quality-focused activities.
- Two programs received in-kind support in the form of medical supplies.
- All four of the largest education programs (Burkina, Ghana, Haiti and India) received significant in-kind support from communities and education officers.
- One country used CRS private allocations to support education programming.

Slow progress in securing substantial complementary funding is not surprising, given the host of other challenges faced by FAE program managers. For most, this first DAP proved to be a "settling in" period: managers were so focused on the program that they found it difficult to devote time to funding. At best, this period has allowed CRS to establish its programs and develop accompanying fundraising and programming strategies for the future. As FAE approaches the end of its "pilot" phase, acquisition of non-FFP support has become critical, primarily because FFP has indicated that it will not permit monetization for FAE programs, and that it will neither increase FAE program allocations for existing programs, nor fund any new FAE programs. In the coming years, those FAE programs that are successful in securing non-FFP funding can continue to build upon their successes since 1995 as they forge ever stronger programs based on the FAE model.